A single session of Acu-TENS increases FEV₁ and reduces dyspnoea in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a randomised, placebo-controlled trial

Ken SL Lau¹ and Alice YM Jones²

¹Kowloon Hospital ²The Hong Kong Polytechnic University
Hong Kong

Introduction

Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease is a progressive condition characterised by airflow limitation which is not fully reversible (WHO). Dyspnoea, excessive sputum production, and chronic cough are the most common symptoms. It is estimated that 3 million people died of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in 2005 and WHO predicts that it will be the fourth leading cause of death worldwide by 2030 (WHO). Management of stable chronic obstructive pulmonary disease includes pharmacotherapy for relief of symptoms, pulmonary rehabilitation programs for health education, and exercise to improve exercise tolerance and dyspnoea (GOLD 2007). Adverse effects of medications have encouraged alternative approaches to management of patients with chronic illness. Acupuncture has been reported as an alternative mode of management for breathlessness (dyspnoea) in oncology patients (Cohen et al 2005, Pan et al 2000) as well as in patients with respiratory disease (Davis et al 2001, Jobst et al 1986, Lewith et al 2004). A review of 16 randomised control trials, involving 2937 participants, concluded that acupuncture is a safe and potentially-effective intervention for patients with asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (Jobst 1995).

Acupuncture is invasive and therefore carries some risk of injury (Lao et al 2003, Peuker and Gronemeyer 2001, Vilke and Wulfert 1997). Application of transcutaneous electrical nerve stimulation, a non-invasive modality, over specific acupuncture points (Acu-TENS) is believed to elicit similar responses to manual acupuncture in pain relief (Grant et al 1999, Kerr et al 2003, Ng et al 2003). Acu-TENS can be administered by the patient or their carers and if proven to be effective, may assist control of dyspnoea and thereby promote quality of life in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. The effect of Acu-TENS on dyspnoea has not been reported for any population.

The research question in this study of patients with stable chronic obstructive pulmonary disease was:

Questions: What is the immediate effect of a single 45-minute session of transcutaneous electrical nerve stimulation over acupuncture points (Acu-TENS) on lung function and dyspnoea in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease? Design: Randomised, placebo-controlled trial with concealed allocation, participant blinding, assessor blinding, and intention-to-treat analysis. Participants: Forty-six ambulatory patients with a mean age of 75 years, with stage I or II chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, and with no previous experience of TENS or acupuncture. Intervention: The experimental group received 45 minutes of Acu-TENS over acupuncture point EX-B1 bilaterally (0.5 ‘cun’ lateral to the spinous process of the 7th cervical vertebra) while the control group received placebo-TENS with identical electrode placement but no electrical output despite a flashing light indicating stimulus delivery. Outcome measures: Lung function was measured as FEV₁ and FVC while dyspnoea was measured using a shortness of breath 100-mm visual analogue scale. Results: After 45 minutes of Acu-TENS, the experimental group had increased FEV₁ by 0.12 litres (95% CI 0.07 to 0.15) and decreased dyspnoea by 10.7 mm (95% CI –13.9 to –7.6) more than the control group. The effect on FVC was only small (mean difference 0.05 litres, 95% CI –0.01 to 0.10). Conclusion: Acu-TENS may be a useful non-invasive adjunctive intervention in the management of dyspnoea in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. This study suggests that the effect of long-term Acu-TENS warrants further investigation. [Lau KSL, Jones AYM (2008) A single session of Acu-TENS increases FEV₁ and reduces dyspnoea in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a randomised, placebo-controlled trial. Australian Journal of Physiotherapy 54: 179–184]

Key words: Acupuncture points, Acupressure, TENS, Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, Forced expiratory volume, Dyspnoea
beginning of the trial so that randomisation was concealed from the patient and opened by the investigator who applied the interventions. Participants rested for 30 minutes after which lung function and dyspnoea were measured. All participants then received 45 minutes of either Acu-TENS or placebo-TENS. Participants in the control group were told that the stimulation frequency selected was not perceivable by humans so participants were blind to group allocation. One investigator was responsible for the application of both interventions. Then, lung function and dyspnoea were measured again. Data collection and entry was performed by a person blinded to group allocation.

**Participants**

Patients were included if they had a diagnosis of stage I or II chronic obstructive pulmonary disease according to the GOLD classification (GOLD 2001), an ability to communicate, and were independent in mobility with or without a walking aid. They were excluded if they had co-existing ischaemic heart disease, a cardiac pacemaker, diabetes mellitus, a neurological deficit, poor perception and/or cognitive function, an acute exacerbation of obstructive airways disease within one month prior to data collection, or had previously received TENS or acupuncture. Participants were also excluded from the study if they had received a bronchodilator less than 6 hours prior to data collection. Demographic data such as age, gender, smoking history and medication were recorded.

**Intervention**

The experimental group received 45 minutes of Acu-TENS at bilateral acupoints Ex-B1 (known as Ding Chuan in Traditional Chinese Medicine), located at 0.5 ‘cun’ lateral to the spinous process of 7th cervical vertebra, where 1 cun is the distance between the medial creases of the interphalangeal joints of an individual’s middle finger. Ex-B1 was chosen since it is the point most commonly reported in the Chinese literature for management of shortness of breath (Ngai et al 2006). Once determined, each acupoint was cleaned with an alcohol swab to reduce resistance to passage of current and marked. A non-conductive plastic film 50 x 50 mm² was punctured in the middle creating a pore of diameter 0.79 mm. This film was then placed over the participant’s skin, with the pore directly over the marked acupoint. A 50 x 50 mm² electrode was then placed over each plastic film (Figure 1). This configuration restricts electrical stimulation to the acupoint only. The bilateral electrodes were attached to a TENS machine². Stimulation was at a frequency of 4 Hz and pulse width 200 microseconds. Intensity was set at the highest tolerable by the participant short of discomfort. Reliability of voltage output of the machine was tested using a laboratory oscilloscope prior to data collection.

The control group received 45 minutes of placebo-TENS. A plastic film with no central pore was placed on the skin over each marked acupoint. Participants could see the output light flashing but no current was transmitted to the acupoint throughout the 45 minutes. Prior to data collection, the absence of electrical stimulation employed by this method was affirmed in five participants.

**Outcome measures**

Lung function was measured as forced expiratory volume in 1 second (FEV₁) and forced vital capacity (FVC) according to the American Thoracic Society recommendations (American Thoracic Society 1995) using a spirometer calibrated with a 3-litre super syringe. All measurements were performed in the sitting position and the best of 3 trials was recorded. Dyspnoea was measured using a shortness of breath 100-mm visual analogue scale (Martinez et al 2000) where zero represented ‘not breathless at all’ and 100 mm represented ‘the worst breathless sensation you ever experienced’.

**Data analysis**

The clinical significance of the effect of Acu-TENS is reported as mean difference (95% CI) while the statistical significance is reported as p values from independent t-tests. Analysis was by intention-to-treat. A statistical significance level was set at p < 0.05.

**Results**

**Flow of participants through the trial**

A total of 46 participants (31 male and 15 female) from 4 community centres for the elderly met the inclusion criteria. The mean age was 75 years (SD 7), mean BMI was 23.6 kg/m² (SD 4.4); predicted FEV₁ was 69% (SD 14) and predicted FVC was 73% (SD 13). Fifteen participants (33%) were ex-smokers (ie, they had stopped smoking for over 12 months), 22 (48%) were current smokers, and 9 (20%) were non-smokers. Age, BMI, % predicted FEV₁ and FVC
were similar between the two groups (Table 1). Medications prescribed were: Boclaezone (250 mcg), theophylline (200 mg/300mg), Ventolin (1–4 puffs), and/or Atrovent/Combivent (1–2 puffs) as required. Medication for both groups was similar and none of the 46 participants received bronchodilators less than 6 hours prior to lung function measurements.

### Compliance with trial method

All participants who met the inclusion criteria completed the trial. There was no report of adverse effects. All participants completed the post-intervention measurements, and all participants’ data were included in the intention-to-treat analysis.

### Effect of intervention

Group data as well as within- and between-group data are presented in Table 2 while individual data are presented in Table 3 (see eAddenda for Table 3). After 45 minutes of Acu-TENS, the experimental group had increased their FEV<sub>1</sub> by 0.12 litres (95% CI 0.07 to 0.15, p < 0.001) more than the control group. They had increased their FVC by 0.05 litres (95% CI –0.01 to 0.10, p < 0.001) more than the control group. They had increased their FVC by 0.05 litres (95% CI –0.01 to 0.10, p < 0.001) more than the control group. They had increased their FVC by 0.05 litres (95% CI –0.01 to 0.10, p < 0.001) more than the control group. They had increased their FVC by 0.05 litres (95% CI –0.01 to 0.10, p < 0.001) more than the control group.

### Discussion

#### Comparison with previous studies

This study showed that a single session of bilateral application of TENS to acupuncture EX-B1 (Ding Chuan) for 45 minutes in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease increased FEV<sub>1</sub> and decreased dyspnoea. Positive effects of acupuncture and acupressure on dyspnoea management have been reported previously. Maa and colleagues (1997) showed that self-administered acupuncture (kneading and pressure) over 7 acupoints (1 to 2 minutes per point) for 6 weeks reduced dyspnoea in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Wu and colleagues (2004) showed that, compared to sham acupuncture, acupressure over 5 acupoints (different from those reported in Maas’s study) for 3 minutes, 5 sessions per week for 4 weeks decreased dyspnoea (measured by the Modified Pulmonary Function Status and Dyspnoea Questionnaire). Walking capacity, and reduced anxiety. Maa’s group (2003) also compared the effect of acupuncture and acupressure on dyspnoea and quality of life in patients with chronic obstructive asthma and found that patients who received acupuncture reported an 18-fold improvement in the St George’s Respiratory Questionnaire score compared with a 6-fold improvement in patients who received acupressure. While our findings of decreased dyspnoea are similar to previous studies, direct comparison is not possible because previous studies investigated the effect of needle acupuncture, acupressure, and even moxibustion (burning of herbs over certain acupuncture points) (Jobst et al 1986) as part of the intervention. Furthermore, acupuncture points were not standardised in many of the studies and duration of intervention varied between studies. A combination of points was used in many studies as some points were believed to improve the flow of energy (Qi) as well as decrease dyspnoea whereas in our study, the stimulation of Ex-B1 was standardised.

St George’s Respiratory Questionnaire (Lewith et al 2004), the Pulmonary Function Status and Dyspnoea Questionnaire (Wu et al 2004), the Shuttle Test (Davis et al 2001) and the 6-min Walk Test (Maa et al 2003) have all been used to evaluate the effect of acupuncture on dyspnoea in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Most studies reported a positive effect of acupuncture on dyspnoea, but whether acupuncture improved quality of life in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease remains controversial. While Maa’s group (2003) showed that the St George’s Respiratory Questionnaire score improved significantly more after acupuncture than acupressure, Lewith and colleagues (2004) reported that the improvement in St George’s Respiratory Questionnaire scores did not differ significantly from the effect of sham TENS (no electrical output). Davis and colleagues (2001) commented that the Shuttle Test was ‘impractical in a domiciliary environment’ because most patients lacked a 10-m flat space at their residence (Davis et al 2001). Furthermore, while these measures may be appropriate for evaluation of the effect of long-term acupuncture, they may not be sufficiently sensitive to evaluate the effect of a single acupuncture session.

#### Mechanism of effect of acupuncture on dyspnoea

According to traditional Chinese medicine, dyspnoea results from a deficiency in the flow of ‘Qi’ (energy) in the lungs (Xu and Tan 1988) and application of an appropriate acupuncture technique is thought to restore the ‘Qi balance’. This concept led to the use of a combination of points including those that were believed to restore energy and improve the flow of Qi (Maa et al 1997). However a satisfactory explanation of Qi flow and balance according to western medicine, has not yet been described (Tan and Yong 1998). Western medicine hypothesises that signals from stimulation of peripheral nerve fibres (possibly through acupuncture points) can influence hypothalamic functions via the dorsal periaqueductal grey fibres, and thereby influence the respiratory centre in the medulla, modifying respiration (Takeshige et al 1993). Investigation of the relationship between acupuncture and neural activity has been reported. Stimulation of vision-related acupoints has been shown to be associated with activation of the occipital lobe using functional magnetic resonance imaging (Cho et al 1998). Electroencephalography has been used to demonstrate a relationship between acupuncture and brain activity...
Application of TENS, at a tolerable intensity in humans, has been shown to stimulate α and β nerve fibres (Levin and Hui-Chan 1993). We hypothesised that the application of TENS over acupoints may induce signal transmission similar to acupuncture, influencing vagal afferents via hypothalamic stimulation. However, determining whether the decrease in dyspnoea was a result of hypothalamic activity associated with endorphin release was beyond the scope of our study. The physiological mechanism underlying dyspnoea is complex and further investigation of the association between Acu-TENS and endorphin levels on dyspnoea is warranted.

Mechanism of effect of Acu-TENS on dyspnoea

Application of TENS, at a tolerable intensity in humans, has been shown to stimulate α and β nerve fibres (Levin and Hui-Chan 1993). We hypothesised that the application of TENS over acupoints may induce signal transmission similar to acupuncture, influencing vagal afferents via hypothalamic stimulation. However, determining whether the decrease in dyspnoea was a result of hypothalamic activity associated with endorphin release was beyond the scope of our study. The physiological mechanism underlying dyspnoea is complex and further investigation of the association between Acu-TENS and endorphin levels on dyspnoea is warranted.

Clinical implication of the application of Acu-TENS on lung function

This study found that FEV₁ increased by 10% (ie, 120 ml) more after Acu-TENS than placebo-TENS. While there is no complete agreement on standard criteria for evaluation of a short-term response to a bronchodilator (Tashkin et al 2008), the common indicators used to express a positive response to a bronchodilator are ≥15% improvement over pre-bronchodilator FEV₁ (ACCP 1974); ≥12% improvement plus an absolute volume increase of ≥200 ml (Pellegrino et al 2005) and an absolute improvement over pre-bronchodilator FEV₁ of ≥10% predicted value (Anthonisen and Wright 1986). The improvement of FEV₁ in this study did not reach these standards, however direct comparison between effects of bronchodilators and Acu-TENS may not be appropriate. It is believed that bronchodilators decrease dyspnoea by reducing residual volume (air-trapping) (Price et al 2004). Bronchodilators are chemicals that specifically target reversible bronchoconstriction through neuromuscular transmission at receptors over the airways, inducing relaxation of airway smooth muscle.

This study found that FEV₁ increased by 10% (ie, 120 ml) more after Acu-TENS than placebo-TENS. While there is no complete agreement on standard criteria for evaluation of a short-term response to a bronchodilator (Tashkin et al 2008), the common indicators used to express a positive response to a bronchodilator are ≥15% improvement over pre-bronchodilator FEV₁ (ACCP 1974); ≥12% improvement plus an absolute volume increase of ≥200 ml (Pellegrino et al 2005) and an absolute improvement over pre-bronchodilator FEV₁ of ≥10% predicted value (Anthonisen and Wright 1986). The improvement of FEV₁ in this study did not reach these standards, however direct comparison between effects of bronchodilators and Acu-TENS may not be appropriate. It is believed that bronchodilators decrease dyspnoea by reducing residual volume (air-trapping) (Price et al 2004). Bronchodilators are chemicals that specifically target reversible bronchoconstriction through neuromuscular transmission at receptors over the airways, inducing relaxation of airway smooth muscle. The proposed effect of Acu-TENS on FEV₁ is through central processing of neural signals whereas its action on airways, if any, is indirect. Furthermore, acute dyspnoea ratings and changes in FEV₁ are not necessarily linear, and a decrease in dyspnoea does not correlate with an increase in FEV₁ (O’Donnell et al 1997). Although the improvement in FEV₁ demonstrated in this study did not reach the gold standard set for ‘bronchodilator’ evaluation, this study revealed that Acu-TENS improved FEV₁ by 10% more than placebo-TENS, which is very close to the ≥10% predicted value’ standard proposed (Anthonisen and Wright 1986). Furthermore, a decrease in dyspnoea score by 13% more after Acu-TENS than placebo-TENS, which is very close to the ≥10% predicted value’ standard proposed (Anthonisen and Wright 1986). Furthermore, a decrease in dyspnoea score by 13% more than placebo-TENS should not be underestimated.

This study found Acu-TENS improved FVC by only 3% (ie, 50 ml) over placebo-TENS which was statistically insignificant. The total volume of air exhaled during forced expiration should increase when airway narrowing is less, but with one session of Acu-TENS, a clinically-significant change in FVC was not expected.

Limitations of the study

This study has several limitations. First, the severity of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease of the participants...
was moderate. Even though the participants reported a mean dyspnoea score as high as 80 on a 100-mm visual analogue scale, the high end anchor of our visual analogue scale was ‘the worst breathlessness sensation ever experienced.’ Our predictive values were based on Lam’s sample of Chinese participants (Lam et al 1982). If our predictive values were based on a European data base (Roca et al 1986), the predicted FEV1 of our participants would be 50% which would categorise them very close to severe (GOLD 2007).

Most participants travelled to the centre by bus and had to walk some distance to the community centre. Participants who took part in the study were those who did not take their bronchodilator on the day of assessment. Although they were allowed 30 minutes of rest before measurement of lung function, this may not have been sufficient for their dyspnoea to return to normal resting levels. Therefore, it may not be appropriate to extrapolate our findings to patients with mild chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and moderate dyspnoea. It should however be noted that if the expected effect of acupuncture is to maintain homeostasis, the effect of Acu-TENS on patients might be more dramatic on patients with high but not low level of dyspnoea. Second, this study focused on the effect of a single session of Acu-TENS in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease patients and the potential long term effects of Acu-TENS on dyspnoea were not explored. Third, we compared the effect of TENS or placebo-TENS over acupuncture points rather than TENS applied over non acupuncture points and therefore we are unable to draw conclusions on whether the expected effect of Acu-TENS was in fact acupoint-specific or a general effect of TENS. Fourth, we did not measure quality of life, although function is related to dyspnoea and determines quality of life.

This study demonstrated that, compared to placebo-TENS, with no electrical stimulation, bilateral application of Acu-TENS at acupuncture point EX-B1 for 45 minutes in ambulatory patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease lead to an improvement in dyspnoea and FEV1. TENS is a non-invasive, user-friendly, low cost, electrotherapy modality, and the application of Acu-TENS may assist dyspnoea management in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease with the potential to improve activity levels and quality of life. The encouraging effect of Acu-TENS in our patient cohort suggests that Acu-TENS may be a useful adjunctive intervention in the management of dyspnoea in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. The effect of Acu-TENS on endorphin levels, its combined effect with medication on dyspnoea, its effect on frequency or intensity of disease exacerbation; and its long-term effect on the quality of life in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, warrant further investigation.

Footnotes: *NeuroTrac, model CE 0120, Verity Medical LTD, England, UK. **Pony spirometer graphic, COSMED, Italy.

Addenda: Table 3 available at www.physiotherapy.asn.au/AJP.

Ethics: The Human Subjects Ethics Committee of Hong Kong Polytechnic University approved this study. Informed consent was gained from all subjects before data collection began.

Competing interests: None declared.

Acknowledgements: The authors are indebted to Mr Barry Chan for his assistance in data collection and establishing the reliability of the equipment used in this study. We are also grateful to Mr Brian Choi, our biostatistician, for his advice on statistical analysis. We would like to thank the staff of the community centres where this study was conducted and all the patients who participated.

Correspondence: Professor Alice Jones, Department of Rehabilitation Sciences, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hung Hom, Kowloon, Hong Kong. Email: rsajones@polyu.edu.hk

References


